

To Accreditation Council  
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care  
June 12, 2022

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE  
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME  
7R01102 - "RHEUMATOLOGY (ADULT, CHILDREN'S)"  
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR  
POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY)  
IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

**NEI "KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"**

**external expert evaluation period: May 30-31 - June 1, 2022**

**Almaty, 2022**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"	5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	5
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	5
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	10
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"	12
6.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"	21
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	21
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of the external evaluation and educational programme of the residency in the specialty of the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"	22
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	23

### List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Designation
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
DLT	DLT – distance learning technologies
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
FA	final attestation
IEPI	Individual Educational Plan
RW	research work
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NEI "KazRosmeduniversity"	Non-state educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
PGE	postgraduate education
AT	AT – Advanced Training
RT	retraining
TS	Teaching staff
EP	Educational Programmes
WEPI	Working Educational plan
NCIE	National Independent Examination Centre
QMS	Quality Management System
IWR	independent work of a resident trainee
IWRT	trainee under the supervision of a clinical mentor during the clinical activity of the resident trainee
EMC	educational and methodological council
EMCD	educational and methodological complexes of disciplines
GPA	Grade Point Average - the arithmetic mean of the grades obtained for all the courses, taking into account the time spent on them

## 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 19 dated May 20, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" in the period May 30-June 1, 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	clinical specialties department of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading researcher of JSC "Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology" Almaty
2	Foreign Expert	Zakirova Guzel Zakirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of Kazan State Medical University, Ophthalmologist of the Children's Republican Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Tatarstan
3	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 - "Medical University of Astana" NJSC;
4	Academic Expert	Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector for Educational and Scientific Activities Kazakh Medical University "KSPH", Accredited independent expert on accreditation of medical organizations, Deputy Chairperson of the Board of the RPO "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations"
5	Academic Expert	Sarsenbayeva Gulzhan Iskendirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Doctor of the Department of Cardiac Surgery and Interventional Cardiology of the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery JSC
6	Academic Expert	Bacheva Irina Viktorovna	PhD in Medicine, associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases, Head of the Residency Educational Programme in Nephrology, including Pediatric, NJSC Medical University of Karaganda
7	Academic Expert	Laryushina Elena Mikhailovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, head of the Department of Internal Diseases, NJSC Medical University of Karaganda
8	Academic Expert	Sultanova Gulnar Dosnovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Dean of the Faculties of Dentistry, Pharmacy, Public Health Care and Nursing of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
9	Employers' representative	Nurgaliyev Nurlan Yermekbayevich	Director general of GammaLab Diagnostic Laboratory LLP
10	Resident Representative	Maykenova Arailim Muratkyzy	Resident of the first year of study in the specialty "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" .

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", BIN : 970 240 002 300
Management body	Academic Council, Academic Council, Scientific and Clinical Council, Local Ethics Commission, Coordination Council for Quality and Strategic Development
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created in	(1992)
Location and contact details	Almaty, str. Abylai Khan 51/53 Tel: +7(771)495-60-51, +7(778) 188-54-48E-mail: <a href="mailto:info@medkrmu.kz">info@medkrmu.kz</a>
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	No.0137388 dated July 8, 2021
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2021
Duration of training	2
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	no.
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	1 (1 year of study)
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	39 (84.6%) for accredited EP – 1 full-time (100%) (Doctor of Medical Sciences, Prof.)

Training in the residency under the educational programme 7R01102 "**Rheumatology (adult, children's)**" in the NEI "KazGosmeduniversity" has been carried out since 2021. The number of students is 1. The head of the educational programme is Professor, MD Tukesheva Bagira Sharipbaevna (Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases), clinical mentor – Head of the 2-nd rheumatology department Kalykova Maysa Bayuzakovna. The development of an educational programme in the specialty of residency is based on the Regulation on the management of the educational programme. The vice-rector responsible for the educational activities of the residency is the vice-rector for academic activities. Clinical bases are selected for compliance with the residency programme by the clinical work department, which draws up contracts with clinical bases - City Rheumatology Center, Children's Clinical Hospital No. 2.

The educational programme is implemented in accordance with the State Standard for Education and Science of 2020, includes relevant specialized disciplines, with a mandatory component and a component of choice, the distribution of disciplines by hours, semesters is carried out by the

COP and the department of academic work. Duration of study in residency is 2 years, or 140 credits, 4 of which fall on the component of choice. The CED presents the following disciplines: "Differential diagnosis of diseases associated with fever syndrome", "Principles of genetic engineering biological therapy (GEBT) in rheumatology", "Management of scientific research", "Evidence-based medicine". An individual curriculum for the resident for the entire period of study was formed, agreed with the curator and approved by the head of the department. The syllabuses indicate the place and time of consultations on the training of the resident, a contract with clinical bases has been drawn up. The academic year consists of 45 weeks, which is 2,100 hours and includes theoretical, clinical training and holidays, lasting 6 weeks between academic years. Final assessment lasting 2 weeks. The training week consists of 54 hours, 1/3 of which consists of independent work of the resident, which includes patient management, participation in consultations of serious patients, duty in the departments of the clinic, mastering practical skills, preparation of reports, work in the library, participation in scientific and practical conferences.

Pedagogical staff of the Department of Internal Diseases involved in the implementation of the educational programme: the head of the educational programme has an academic degree of doctor of medical sciences, experience of scientific and pedagogical work - 43 years, 8 publications for the last 5 years, a certificate of training in the use of DLT.

Teaching of academic disciplines is based on modern achievements in the field of science and practice, as well as modern educational technologies, which imply the construction of educational trajectories in accordance with the competence approach and the introduction of active teaching methods. The scientific interests of the department's employees are due to the profile of the clinical base and the specialty. The research work of the department is regulated by the research work plan.

## **2.2. Information on previous accreditation**

Specialized accreditation of the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" has not been carried out to date.

## **2.3. Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01102 " Rheumatology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions**

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 93 pages of the main text, appendices on 28 pages, copies or electronic versions of 5 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLU52VaCBZtcVaOjl5FO>

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 8 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the rector of NEI "KRMU", MD, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

Since the educational programme undergoes the primary accreditation procedure, the standard 9 "Continuous renewal" has not been described. The assessment according to Standard 9 will be included in the assessment during post-accreditation monitoring in case of a positive decision on accreditation of the educational programme.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Bekmagambetov Zh.M., Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Accreditation

The self-assessment of the educational programme **7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"** was carried out on the basis of the order of the Rector of the University No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert Kurmanova A.M., the review noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the feedback process with the representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All the standards provide real practice for the training of residents in the 7R01102 **"Rheumatology (adult, children's)"** programme, taking into account the beginning of student admission in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. External expert evaluation assessment**

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01102 **"Rheumatology (adult, children's)"** was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on May 20, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of KazRossmeduniversity (hereinafter – KRMU/University) Dzhainakbayev N.T. Dates of the visit to the organization: 30-31 May-1 June 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 19 people in total;
- interviews with residents – 14 people, including foreign – 1 (India);
- studying the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/>;
- interviewing 6 employees, 8 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents - 14 and 12, respectively;
- observation of residents' education - attendance at practical classes: the topic of the practical lesson (magazine club): "Eosinophilic granulomatosis of Cherja-stross", teacher Zordinova K.A., groups 20-01, 21-01, 21-01. Venue: City Clinical Hospital No.1, Kalkaman microdistrict, Ashimova, 2,

- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 2 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including City Clinical Hospital No.7, Kalkaman-1, 1 and City Clinical Hospital No.1, Kalkaman microdistrict, Ashimova, 2, where training is carried out on 5 educational programmes with the participation of 2/5 of full-time teachers/ part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 38 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

**Table 1 -Information about the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Job Title</b>
1	Seidalin Arystan Oskarovich.	acting Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work
2	Kusainova Arman Sailavbekovna	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs
3	Tatyana Anatolyevna Sovostyanova	Acting Vice-Rector for Educational Work
4	Orazaeva Flyura Ganievna	acting Head of the Department of Magistracy and Doctoral Studies
5	Orakbai Lyazzat Zhadigerovna	head of the Residency Department
6	Dossaeva Saltanat Tasbulatovna	chief specialist of the residency department
7	Kasimova Arzygul Imarovna	chief specialist of the residency department
8	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	chairperson of the committee of educational programmes (residency and doctoral studies)
9	Tursun Anna Olegovna	secretary of the admission postgraduate commission
10	Kulebayeva Elmira Kuanyshevna	head of the Career Center
11	Iskakova Dana Askarovna	Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility, etc.
12	Mansharipova Alma Toleuovna	Academic Secretary
13	Severova Elena Anatolyevna	LEC Executive Secretary
14	Vera Ivanovna Verovkina	head of Personnel Department
15	Uysenbayeva Sharbanu Omirgaliyevna	Head of the educational and methodological department
16	Aumoldaeva Zaure Maratovna	head of the Training and Clinical Center
17	Valiulina Marzhan Bekarystanovna	Head of Library
18	Manapova Damira Edigeevna	Head of test center
19	Alexander Viktorovich Vodovtsev	Head of the Department of Distance Education Technologies
<b>Residency Teachers</b>		
1	Zordinova Karamyat Akhmetovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Internal Medicine
2	Gulnara Serikovna Esnazarova	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Medicine
3	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice
4	Karabaeva Aigul Zhumartovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department of General Medical Practice
<b>Student residencies</b>		
13	Dia Mikhail Olegovich	resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty



		7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"
<b>Healthcare Practitioners</b>		
1	Baizhigitova Nazipa Begalievna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital No.1
2	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital on the Right of Economic Management "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
3	Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna	Director of MC "Rakhat"
4	Isabekov Nurzhan Amangeldiyevich	Deputy Director of Surgery, CCCH
5	Kunaeva Gulbanu Janabaevna	Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the CCCH
6	Bukumbayeva Damira Dzhurumbayevna	IE "Bukumbayeva"

In the process of visiting the units of the University of Accreditation Experts, the strengths of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational programme were noted, including:

1. A university that responds flexibly to today's healthcare challenges
2. Availability of all levels of medical education (college, bachelor's degree, residency, master's degree, doctoral degree), ensuring the continuity and commitment of students to this university
3. Close interaction with practical health care – multidisciplinary hospitals equipped with modern equipment to achieve the goals of education, which contributes to the adequate training of students.

A review of resources directly related to the educational programme 7R01102 "**Rheumatology (adult, children's)**" showed that the NEI "KRMU" does not have its own clinic, but has contracts with clinical bases – the City Rheumatology Center, the State Clinical Hospital No.1, the State Clinical Hospital No.2, providing specialized and high-tech medical care in an emergency and in a planned manner to patients from all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, equipped with modern therapeutic and diagnostic equipment.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01102"**Rheumatology (adult, children's)**"for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Kurmanova A.M. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC. At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

#### **4. Results of the survey.**

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 30.05.2022<https://webanketa.com/>.

**The resident survey includes 22 questions.**

In total 12 people (in total 14 residents for the current year) answered.

This university will be recommended as an organization of education –75 % fully agree, partially -25 %. Fully agree 83.3% of respondents, 8.33% partially agree and 8.33% doubt that programme managers and faculty are aware of their learning challenges. Completely (83.3%), partially (8.3%) and doubt the answer (8.3%) with the conditions and equipment of the study rooms, university classrooms. According to 100% (full) office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 100%. Fully (100%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources.

The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially. Satisfied completely (91.67%) and partially (8.33%) with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 100% fully agree. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills – completely agree 91.67%, partially 8.33%. According to 91.67% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, and according to 8.33% - sometimes.

According to 100% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes. Fully satisfied that study in higher education 83.33%, partly 16.67% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, 91.67% are confident, 8.33% cannot give an answer, 0% would like to believe it, 0% began to doubt it. 100% are fully satisfied with the organization of teaching in the NEI KRMU.

According to 75% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 16.67% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 8.33% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 91.67% of residents, satisfactory – 8.33%.

**Conclusions:** the majority of students of 9 educational programmes are completely satisfied with the organization of training, relations with teachers, the attitude of the university management to them, the availability of educational resources. More than 75 per cent of respondents praised the practical training and teaching methods used by teachers. The work of the external expert commission of the accreditation center is estimated at 75% and the interviewed have an understanding of the need for accreditation as a procedure for ensuring the quality of higher and postgraduate education.

**The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions.** A total of 14 people responded (14 in total in the state), with a pedagogical experience of up to 5 years – 7.14%, up to 10 years – 28.57%, more than 10 years – 64.29%.

100% satisfied with the organization of the educational process. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 100%. Completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 92.86% of respondents, partially - 7.14%. There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization - 100% fully agree.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research – 100% completely agree. 92.86% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, doubt with the answer – 7,14%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. 100% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. Unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, they applied for payment of travel, business trips, registration fee – 7.14%, for payment of registration fee – 7.14%, and 35.71% did not apply with this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. 100% of respondents fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -92,86%, sometimes -7.14% of the respondents. Students are taught using a variety of teaching methods, but more often work is done by analyzing situational tasks (88.06%),

working in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%), performing abstracts (50%), performing projects, coursework (50%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center (50%), oral analysis of the topic of classes (78.57%) oral surveys and analysis of the topic (64.29%), working in small groups (50%) also problem-oriented learning (57.14%), solving tests (71.43%), solving cases (42.86%), less often written completion of tasks (28.57%). Completely according to 92.86% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 7.14% partially agree with this.

**Conclusions:** The survey showed that 100% of respondents are satisfied with the organization of the educational process at the university and have the opportunity to engage in research. 100% of respondents fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 42.86% are aware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers. 92% of respondents noted that their opinion is taken into account by the management of the university and believe that the results of this survey can be useful for developing recommendations for improving the key activities of the university.

Thus, **areas for improvement have been identified: increasing** the publication activity of teachers and supporting the university in this matter; informing teachers about social support programmes.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes – the presence of management bodies in the form of the Academic Council, the Academic Council, the Scientific and Clinical Council, the Local Ethics Commission, the Coordination Council for Quality and Strategic Development, the Council of Young Scientists.

## **5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

##### **1.1 1.1 Mission statement and deliverables**

The mission of the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" is to form the competence and personal qualities of competitive, creative and innovative thinking, able to realize their knowledge and skills of new generation specialists, which corresponds to the mission of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" as an innovative, socially oriented, practically-oriented, internationally recognized university and the main programme documents in the field of education and health - Addresses of the President of Kazakhstan, Programme Articles of the President of Kazakhstan, the Law of Kazakhstan "On Education" with amendments and additions, Decrees of the President of Kazakhstan, State development programmes, orders and road maps of the Ministry of Education and Health of Kazakhstan.

In the process of studying the self-assessment report and following the results of the interview with vice-rectors, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of Standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for 2019-2025 was reviewed, including such areas as improving the quality of services through the development of university educational programmes, developing the scientific potential of the university, improving management processes, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of

classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases.

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

The University implements the elements of institutional autonomy through the presence of the mechanism of academic freedom, which implies the autonomy of the development and implementation of EP, syllabuses, CED, IEP, WEPI within the framework of the SCES and standard curricula; the choice of clinical bases. Assessment of the educational achievements of residents is carried out by various forms of control;

The relationship between the University and the student is regulated by the "Internal Regulations for Students", "Academic Policy" and the agreement for the provision of educational services, which is concluded with each student when enrolling in the University.

### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

Learning outcomes are defined in the EP and include knowledge, skills, need for analysis, communication skills, and ongoing resident learning. The content of the educational programme is formed in such a way that modern trends of medicine are taken into account, evidence-based medicine data are used for diagnosis and effective practice of diseases, developing the skills of residents for continuous lifelong learning.

### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

The self-assessment report noted that the participation of stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and final results is provided for by the procedures for discussion of the student audience, graduates, employees of the department, at the meeting of the CEP, at the Academic Council and the Academic Council of the University; peer review and survey by external parties. However, there are no suggestions or recommendations on the final learning outcomes in the employer's review and survey results during the external visit.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 17 standards: fully – 16, partially – 1, non-compliant – 0

#### ***Standard 1: Implemented***

There are no suggestions or recommendations on the final results of training in the review and the results of the survey on the part of the employer.

#### ***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1. The final results of training should be determined taking into account proposals from interested parties, including representatives of the employer (1.4.2.)

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **2.1 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework**

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established.

Attending the practical lesson on the topic "Eosinophilic granulomatosis of Cherja-stross" in the form of a magazine club, the experts received convincing data that the resident of the "Adult rheumatology, pediatric" EP presents the main theoretical part and a clinical example, other residents prepare reviews, participate in the discussion. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics (K-03-21-11, 26.11.2021) and during the interview the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

#### **2.2 Scientific method**

The implementation of these strategies is provided by a whole range of measures implemented within the framework of the classroom and extracurricular components of the EP when studying both

mandatory and elective disciplines. When studying the resident's portfolio, there are certificates of participation in scientific and practical conferences (Winter School of Rheumatology), but there is no instruction to perform tasks based on the application of methods of scientific analysis (publications).

### **2.3 Content of the residency programme**

The programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines – 134 credits, a component of choice – 4 credits, final certification – 2 credits. Profiling disciplines are represented by disciplines: inpatient rheumatology, adult – 40 credits; inpatient rheumatology, pediatric - 1-30 credits; inpatient rheumatology, pediatric – 2-10 credits; outpatient rheumatology, pediatric – 26 credits; outpatient rheumatology, adult – 28 credits. The component of choice (4 credits) can be selected from the following disciplines: "Differential diagnosis of diseases accompanied by fever syndrome" - 4 credits, "Principles of genetic engineering biological therapy (GEBT) in rheumatology – 4 credits.

### **2.4 Programme structure, content and duration**

The EP is implemented in accordance with the SCES of 2020 and provides the necessary level of training of residents, includes the relevant specialized disciplines. The structure of the educational programme is formed from various types of educational, scientific and clinical work, practices that determine the content of education; it contains components aimed at the development of deep professional skills. At the same time, the CED presents only 2 topics in the relevant disciplines and 2 in the methods of scientific analysis.

### **2.5 Organization of training**

The vice-rector responsible for the educational activities of the residency is the vice-rector for academic activities. Clinical bases are selected for compliance with the residency programme by the clinical work department, which draws up contracts with clinical bases. To conduct classes, residents must have an academic degree, academic title and work experience, mentors must have a medical qualification category and sufficient work experience in a specialty.

When surveying residents, the organization of clinical training, according to 75%, fully satisfies them. 91.67% of the respondents answered that teachers regularly use active and interactive methods of teaching.

When surveying teachers in the training of students, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work is an analysis of situational tasks (88.06%), work in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%),

### **2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care**

At the clinical base, a mentor is assigned to the resident, under the control of which the residents are trained in practical skills and abilities in the diagnosis and treatment of various therapeutic pathologies, as well as in the maintenance of medical records.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1, do not match - 0

#### **Standard 2: Implemented**

Based on your review of the resident portfolio, there are no publications.

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Develop quantitative indicators of R&D performance. The scientific component should be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods (2.2.4)

## **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **3.1 Methods of evaluation**

The methods of assessment of residents at the University are reflected in the internal documents: Academic Policy of the University (R-01-17-14, 27.08.21), Regulations on the current monitoring of

academic performance (PL-03-35-11, 29.08.2019), interim and final certification of students (PL-03-35-11, 29.08.2019).

For testing, a technical specification is drawn up – a matrix of test tasks, which is reflected in the syllabuses. Checklists have been developed for conducting current, milestone and final control in the discipline (Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE). All types of current control according to the checklist (practical classes, seminar classes, IWRT, IWR) and midterm control are calculated according to a 100-point system. Interim certification is carried out in the form of an annual report (portfolio) based on the resident diary. The final state certification is carried out in 2 stages: knowledge assessment (comprehensive testing in all disciplines and skills assessment (mini-clinical examination at the patient's bedside). The academic achievements of residents are evaluated in points on a 100-point scale. The resident academic achievement control systems are carried out by the Registrar's Office, which keeps a history of academic achievements, which is reflected in the transcript. The results of students' academic achievements are recorded in the electronic educational journal through the office-recorder system and the AIS Platonus programme, which automatically generates examination sheets, which is confirmed by experts when viewing electronic journals. The electronic training log is filled in accordance with the calendar and thematic plan, in accordance with the schedule and the dates of the current, milestone and final control reflected in the syllabus. During the visit to the organization and during the interview with the head of the office of the registrar and test center Manapova Damira Yedygeyevna, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents. This information was obtained during an interview with Alexander Vdovtsev, Head of the Department of Distance Education Technologies.

When surveyed, 91.67% of residents fully agree that they are satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills.

### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training**

Evaluation criteria are announced in the first lesson for each discipline. The resident is assessed according to the IEPI upon completion of the discipline practical skills according to the checklist. The teacher or mentor gives feedback in the form of a recommendation. The assessment of the achievability of training results is reflected in the formation of control and measuring tools – test tasks, clinical cases.

*The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full.*

*Standard 3: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement: none*

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and Selection Policy**

The conditions of admission of residents are described in the "Rules of admission to the residency" for the relevant academic year, based on regulatory legal acts. Criteria for applicants entering the residency are determined by the requirements of the SCES – the presence of basic medical education, higher medical education, internship.

The programme of entrance examinations to the residency is formed by the teachers of the university departments and includes an oral examination (interview) in the field of specialty, which includes questions of the main and private sections of the specialty. When studying the programme of entrance examinations, the members of the EEC noted that the questions of the entrance examinations should include only the disciplines of prerequisites and not be highly specialized.

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

The number of students under the accredited educational programme is 1 (1 year of study). The number of residents admitted is regulated by the state order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training. The number of residents per teacher, which is 1:3.

#### **4.3 Resident support and advice**

To this end, the resident is assigned a curator who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, assists in employment and a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. Consultation of residents is based on the results of assessment, questionnaire of residents both in-person and in remote forms. Residents receive information about student support services from information on stands at departments, in the Residence Department and through the website

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

Residents together with university teaching staff have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of training in the accredited specialty in the course of direct discussion and approval of work programmes, at the level of development of an individual work curriculum and elective disciplines. Residents are represented in the CEP, AC, SC.

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

Resident doctors studying under a state educational order are paid a scholarship, are given vacations (not less than 7 weeks), class schedule from 08.00 to 17.00, combining study with work (not more than 0.5 hours) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time with the consent of the curator, the head of the department and the head of the residency department.

Safety of training at the university and at clinical bases is provided by video surveillance systems in administrative, educational buildings and visual control of the university's external territory, conducting safety briefings at workplaces, functioning of fire alarm systems, each floor has an evacuation plan and boards with fire-fighting equipment.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1, do not match - 0

#### **Standard 4: Implemented**

When studying the programme of entrance examinations, the members of the EEC noted that the questions of the entrance examinations should include only the disciplines of prerequisites and not be highly specialized. In this regard,

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) The programme of entrance examinations should include questions only in the disciplines of prerequisites and exclude highly specialized topics (4.1.6).

### **Standard 5: FACULTY**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

##### **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The university has developed regulations on departments, the job descriptions of which are familiar to all employees. The total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of the average ratio of students and teachers – 6:1; undergraduates and teachers – 6:1; residents and teachers – 3:1. Candidates for posts are selected solely on the basis of competitiveness and merit, ensuring that candidates have equal access to the relevant posts, taking into account qualifications, professional indicators and experience.

According to the results of the survey, 92.86% of teachers are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel service, 100% have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research, over the past 5 years have undergone advanced training. However, unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and

national events.

### **5.2 Teachers' obligations and development**

The activities of teachers are planned in accordance with the individual plan of the teacher, which is discussed and approved at the meetings of the department. Teachers' activities are assessed on the basis of the results of educational, methodological, scientific, clinical, educational work and social activities.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during an interview with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes improving the qualifications of teachers according to the plan.

Experts received answers about the teacher development programme, which is held annually and 4 (100%) teachers participating in the educational programme were trained in 2021. The system of professional and pedagogical improvement of teaching staff includes the following units: the School of the Teacher, the Institute of Postgraduate Education, winter and summer schools. These activities are funded by the University. The expert checked the certificates of teachers (on the topic "Remote educational technologies"), there are publications of teaching staff in the editions of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation. At the same time, there is no publication activity of residents under the accredited educational programme.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards: fully – 6, partially – 1, non-compliant – 0

#### **Standard 5: Implemented**

TS publications are available in CCES publications, but not in international peer-reviewed publications.

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Develop criteria for evaluating teachers and clinical mentors in terms of motivating publication activity in international peer-reviewed publications (5.2.4).

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

To form the competencies of students, a Training and Clinical Center is organized, which includes 11 specialized rooms with a total area of 190 m<sup>2</sup>. In 2009, a Mobile Medical Complex was formed. Library as part of the National Database Subscription from Elsevier Scopus and Science Direct. The study rooms are equipped with all the necessary equipment, visual aids, educational material in electronic form, methodological developments in each discipline, and innovative technologies for interactive teaching methods.

The university has a test center for 122 seats, 3 computer rooms for 39 seats, a linguistic office for 15 seats, an electronic library hall for 22 seats. The total number of computers is 500. A department of distance education technologies was created in the structure of the university.

#### **6.2 Clinical Bases**

The University signed agreements on cooperation with 85 medical organizations, including 2 under the accredited educational programme – the City Rheumatology Center for 30 beds (contract No. 117 dated 01.09.2021) and the City Children's Clinical Hospital No.2 (Cardio-Rheumatology Department for 30 beds, contract No. 74 dated 15.09.2020).

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, have a sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment, employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors), provide high-quality education in



compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

During visits to clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and students, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in DAMUMED with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", accessibility of international databases of professional literature, scientific works. In general, students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, students would like more independence in patient management, the holding of international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment in the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in R&D. Members of the External Expert Commission (EEC) Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaire of residents).

### **6.3 Information technology**

The library fund is located in a room with an area of 642.91 m<sup>2</sup>, the area of book preservation is 171.5 m<sup>2</sup>, 204 seats in the reading room. There is literature on accredited EP. The Library has the university electronic library programme ALLmaibook, an electronic catalogue, a hall of scientific literature, where encyclopedias, dictionaries, works of teaching staff of KRMU, periodicals are concentrated, book exhibitions are organized. On the basis of the License Agreement, access to the Russian EBS "IPRbooks" is provided, in test mode it is connected to the database of electronic medical literature "BookUp", there is an agreement on access with the library of Al-Farabi KazNU named after Al-Farabi, with the Kazakhstan National Electronic Library KazNEB.

The university has formed databases of educational information resources, to which there is access from the intranet of the university. The distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle. Students have the opportunity to receive all educational and methodological literature in electronic form, both at the department and in the library. The university provided each department with Internet access.

### **6.4 Clinical Teams**

The skills of working in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists include direct work of residents together with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, participation in republican and city meetings, scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams.

The resident is present during the consultations, fulfills the orders of senior colleagues within his competence. The result of the resident's activity is checked by the teacher.

### **6.5 Medical Research and Advances**

Within the framework of the research of the University, specialized diagnostic medical care is provided to the population of remote regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan using 6 innovative modules of mobile medical complexes to form a single educational, scientific and production complex and the formation of basic research competencies among residents. The research of the department is regulated by the research plan. Interviews with 14 teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the

equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

### **6.6 Education expertise**

Duties of examination in the assessment of education and research in the discipline of medical education are assigned to the department of academic work. The university contributes to the development of the interests of employees in conducting research in education through the training of teaching staff, the participation of teaching staff in various conferences and seminars on medical education. In order to improve the quality of medical education and to develop and improve the pedagogical and professional competencies of teachers and medical workers, a school for teachers has been set up. At the same time, it is recommended that a system of incentives be developed for health education research staff.

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

The NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" has agreements and memoranda of cooperation with 11 higher educational institutions. The University implements the "Academic Mobility of Students" programmes in accordance with the principles of the Bologna process.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully -20, partially - 1.*

#### *Standard 6: Implemented*

When studying the documentation of the department, there are no publications on medical education.

#### *Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

- 1) Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

Monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, including the profiling /graduating and related departments, the residency department, the profile CEP of postgraduate education - analysis of student performance, feedback from students, analysis of the material and technical base and resources for clinical training, the balance of academic staff, the correspondence of the qualifications and professional level of teachers to the matrix of the educational programme, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through feedback from stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students).

#### **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents**

The Rector's blog is used for feedback to teachers and residents. Representatives of residents are members of the CEP, the Academic Council, where they participate in the discussion of the implementation of the educational programme.

#### **7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates**

In 2021, a sociological study "Satisfaction of employers with graduates of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" was conducted by the direction of monitoring of the QEP and the Career Center. 30 employers (60% response rate) from 6 oblasts and the city of Almaty were interviewed. The results of the survey of employers on the quality of training of graduates of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" for 2021 showed that no employer rated the quality of training as low.

#### **7.4 Stakeholder Engagement**

The programme evaluation process involves all stakeholders (faculty, residents, employers) through representation in the relevant structures. Analysis of questionnaires is carried out by the direction of monitoring of the QEP, the results of the questionnaire are discussed at meetings of deans / heads of departments of residency and magistracy with faculty and structural units, students.

Interviews with 2 employers were conducted online and included such issues as: participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of

advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring.

### **7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes**

The mechanism for the approval of educational programmes provides for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes. Examination of the EP is carried out by the CEP for compliance with the SCES approves the CED according to the trajectories of training of a specialist, taking into account pre- and post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the results of training of residents.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.*

*Standard 7: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **8.1 Management**

Coordination of the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties is carried out by the residency department under the supervision of the vice-rector for clinical activities. Assessment of residents and achievement of the final results of training under the residency programme is carried out on the basis of the final state certification. Every FSA and the composition of the certification commission.

Quality assurance of the educational process in the residency is determined by the fulfillment of the mandatory requirements for the level of training and the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of the teaching staff and the implementation of the individual curriculum (IEP) of the resident (open classes, intradepartmental control).

#### **8.2 Academic Leadership**

Direct management of resident programmes and coordination of resident activities since the existence of the resident programme is carried out by the Resident Department. The main purpose of the department is to carry out continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work.

#### **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services.

#### **8.4 Administration and Management**

The staffing table of departments providing educational programmes of the residency is approved annually taking into account changes in the number of students. The University has developed documentation on management of a conceptual nature:

- Strategic development plan of the NEI KazRosmeduniversity”;
- The mission of the university;
- Quality policy and objectives of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity"

#### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The choice of the specialty of residency is regulated by the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KR DSM-116 dated August 28, 2019 "On placement of a state educational order for training in medical and pharmaceutical specialties with postgraduate education for the 2019-2020 academic year"

The interaction of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" with the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process in the residency is carried out through the development and implementation of the State Standardization of Education and Science 2020 and is consistent with the priority areas of national legislative and programme documents: the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On

Education" dated June 27, 2007 No.319-III (with amendments and additions as of 07.07.2020), the State Programme for the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.*

*Standard 8: Implemented*



*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

**6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)"**

1. The final results of training should be determined taking into account proposals from interested parties, including representatives of the employer (1.4.2.)
2. Develop quantitative indicators of R&D performance. The scientific component should be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods (2.2.4)
3. The programme of entrance examinations should include questions only in the disciplines of prerequisites and exclude highly specialized topics (4.1.6).
4. Develop criteria for evaluating teachers and clinical mentors in terms of motivating publication activity in international peer-reviewed publications (5.2.4).
5. Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

## 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01102 "Rheumatology (adult, children's)" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

<b>Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии</b>	Курманова Алмагуль Медеубаевна	
<b>Зарубежный эксперт</b>	Закирова Гузель Закировна	
<b>Национальный академический эксперт</b>	Кауышева Алмагуль Амангельдиновна	
<b>Национальный академический эксперт</b>	Сарсенбаева Гульжан Искендировна	
<b>Национальный академический эксперт</b>	Бачева Ирина Викторовна	
<b>Национальный академический эксперт</b>	Уразова Салтанат Нургожаевна	
<b>Национальный академический эксперт</b>	Ларюшина Елена Михайловна	
<b>Национальный академический эксперт</b>	Султанова Гулнар Достановна	
<b>Эксперт – представитель работодателей</b>	Нургалиев Нурлан Ермекбаевич	
<b>Эксперт – представитель резидентов</b>	Майкенова Арайлым Мураткызы	

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	16	1	
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	29	1	
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11		
4	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	1	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	-		
	<b>Subtotal:</b>	<b>150</b>	<b>141</b>	<b>5</b>	
			<b>146</b>		